

Date of Hearing: June 18, 2024

ASSEMBLY COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION

Mike Fong, Chair

SB 1391 (Rubio) – As Amended June 6, 2024

[Note: This bill is double referred to the Assembly Education Committee and will be heard by that Committee as it related to issues under its jurisdiction.]

SENATE VOTE: 37-0

SUBJECT: Teachers: preparation and retention data

SUMMARY: Requires the Office of the Cradle-to-Career Data System (managing entity) to establish a teacher training and retention dashboard with specified data points by January 1, 2026. Specifically, **this bill:**

- 1) States it is the intent of the Legislature to provide data tools to assist policymakers and agencies in assessing, planning for, and optimizing educational workforce programs with the intended outcome of ensuring all pupils have access to a diverse and sustainable teacher workforce.
- 2) Authorizes the Cradle-to-Career (C2C) managing entity, under the direction of the governing board of the C2C, to create a teacher training and detection dashboard within the data system. The dashboard will include information on the California's teacher workforce that will, at a minimum, include:
 - a) Trends regarding teacher training pipelines;
 - b) Trends regarding teacher credentialing;
 - c) Trends regarding teacher hiring and assignments;
 - d) Trends regarding teacher retention;
 - e) Trends regarding educator demographic data on the entirety of the educator workforce;
 - f) Trends regarding teacher vacancies and mobility;
 - g) Trends regarding the participation in programs for addressing teacher shortages and teacher diversity, including, but not limited to:
 - i) The Teacher Residency Grant Program;
 - ii) The California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program;
 - iii) The Golden State Teacher Grant Program; and,
 - iv) The National Board for Professional Teaching Certification Incentive Program.

- 3) Clarifies the data collected pursuant to (2) (g) of this analysis will address all of the following topics, disaggregated by race and ethnicity:
 - a) The number and percentage of program participants, disaggregated by cohort, who complete a teacher preparation program and earn a preliminary teaching credential;
 - b) Whether the graduates of the programs are teaching in high-need subjects and locations;
 - c) Whether the graduates of the programs are increasing the diversity of the grant recipient's workforce, including the number and percentage of graduates who are members of underrepresented groups;
 - d) Teacher retention rates for program graduates, within boundaries of the grant recipient and within California public schools;
 - e) Program graduate achievement, as determined by first-time pass rates on the state teaching performance assessment;
 - f) The percentage of program participants who complete a beginning teacher induction program and earn a clear teaching credential; and,
 - g) Results from candidate and program graduate surveys of the quality of preparation they received.
- 4) Amends the California Classified School Employee Teacher Credential Program to state it is the intent of the Legislature, to the extent feasible, for data collected by the program to be integrated into the C2C system.
- 5) Authorizes the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards Certificate Incentive Program to collect data on award recipients, including assignment and demographic data. Stipulates it is the intent of the Legislature, to the extent feasible, for data collected by the program to be integrated into the C2C system.
- 6) Amends the Teacher Residency Grant Program to state it is the intent of the Legislature, to the extent feasible, for data collected by the program to be integrated into the C2C system.
- 7) Authorizes the Golden State Teacher Grant Program to collect demographic data on grant recipients. Stipulates it is the intent of the Legislature, to the extent feasible, for data collected by the program to be integrated into the C2C system.

EXISTING LAW:

- 1) Establishes the C2C data system, for the purpose of connecting individuals and organizations to trusted information and resources relating to education, workforce training, employment, health and social services. Authorizes the Office of the C2C data also known as the managing entity, to establish the data system, scale up operational tools for the public, and provide technical assistant for the data system. Authorizes data provides to annually provide data points to the data system. Establishes the C2C governing board to oversee the operations of the C2C data system. The C2C governing board is comprised of 21 member including data providers, public appointees, and two members of the Legislature (Education Code Section 10860 – 10874).

- 2) Authorizes the creation of the California School Employee Teacher Credentialing program to address the state's teacher shortage in science, technology, engineering, and math (STEM), special education, bilingual education, and transitional kindergarten, by recruiting classified employees to enroll in teacher training programs in order to provide instructional service as teachers in public school. Establishes the qualifying criteria for the program and requires a report to be provided to the Legislature by the Commission on Teacher Credentialing each year on the outcomes of the program, as defined (EDC 44393).
- 3) Creates the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards Certification Incentive Program in order to provide awards to teachers employed by school districts of charter schools, who teach at California public school and have attained or will attain a certification from the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards. Each qualifying teacher is eligible to receive up to \$5,000 each year for five years (EDC Section 44395).
- 4) Establishes the Teacher Residency Grant program to support existing or to assist in the development of teacher residency programs that recruit and support the preparation of teachers in designated shortage fields or to support local efforts to recruit and retain a diverse teacher workforce. Requires evaluations of the program to be by the CTC (EDC Section 44415 – 44417.5).
- 5) Establishes the Golden State Teacher Program to provide one-time funding of up to \$20,000 to college students who are enrolled or intent to enroll in a teacher professional preparation program that will lead to a preliminary credential or pupil personnel services credential (EDC 69617).

FISCAL EFFECT: According to the Senate Committee on Appropriations:

- 1) The C2C estimates one-time General Fund costs of \$515,000 to comply with the bill's provisions. This estimate includes \$320,000 for the amendment of an existing contract or a new contract for the inclusion of the additional data elements required by this bill, with the remaining amount of \$195,000 for the design, display, and visualization of the new elements.
- 2) The California Department of Education estimates General Fund costs of \$138,000 and 1.0 position to comply with the bill's data collection requirements.
- 3) The California Student Aid Commission (CSAC) indicates that any costs resulting from this bill would be minor and absorbable within existing resources.

COMMENTS: *Need for the measure.* As indicted by the author, "California is facing a severe teacher shortage, and as state leaders, we must act now. SB 1391 seeks to gather critical data on our teacher workforce, including demographics, to better understand and address issues surrounding California's teacher shortage. Our state has invested heavily in various teacher support programs, but without comprehensive data, we cannot fully assess their impact. Having taught in public schools for nearly 20 years, I have seen the detrimental effects of teacher shortages on student achievement and education quality. This bill will provide the necessary information to build a more diverse and effective teacher workforce reflective of our student population."

The author contends that, "existing law establishes a number of initiatives to recruit, prepare, support, and retain teachers, which education experts suggest can also help with the recruitment

and retention of more teachers of color and multilingual teachers in the teacher workforce. Existing law does not establish consistent oversight or data collection for these programs or the educator workforce as a whole. The lack of comprehensive data about the educator workforce and the related state programs matters because the shortage of qualified teachers in many areas continues to be a challenge in California. It is difficult for state leaders to make better informed policy decisions about future and ongoing investments and programs to support the California educator workforce, because they are unable to answer key questions about the educator workforce and understand the implementation and impact of these current programs in addressing both issues of teacher shortages and diversity.”

SB 1391 (Rubio) will rectify the lack of “consistent oversight or data collection” by requiring the C2C data system to publish a dashboard containing trends in teacher recruitment, and retention along with workforce demographic data. SB 1391 (Rubio) leverages existing data agreements between the C2C and the data providers to ensure data elements related to the California educational workforce are collected and displayed in a manner that will help policymakers make evidence-based decision of where to best use finite state resources to enhance and diversify the teacher workforce in California.

Cradle-to-Career Data System. The C2C is a statewide longitudinal database that incorporates and links data sourced from multiple agencies, who interact with Californians at every stage of their educational journey, from preschool to career. Once operational, the C2C will accept data from 15 different data providers, link the data received, and aggregate and de-identify the data. Once this occurs, the C2C will place the data into publicly consumable dashboards and query tables, and will provide data sets, once approved by data providers, to researchers. Once fully operational, the C2C will maintain de-identified data from education, social service, and workforce entities and will have data on student’s progress from preschool through college and employment. The data system will help policy makers and researchers access data to “foster evidence-based decision-making to help California build a more equitable future.”¹

The C2C is in its third operational year and is part of the Government Operations Agency. The day to day function of the C2C is managed the managing entity, the Office of the C2C, whose executive director is Mary Ann Bates. The governing board is comprised of data providers, members of the public, and representatives from State Legislature. Currently, Assemblymember Irwin and Senator Laird represent the Legislature on the C2C Governing Board.

Since its inception, the C2C has accomplished several major milestones:

- 1) In May 2022, each of the 15 data providers signed legal data agreements with the C2C for the provision of data to the C2C;
- 2) On November 1, 2023, over one billion data points were transmitted from 13 of the 15 data provider to the C2C; and,

¹ <https://c2c.ca.gov/resources/cradle-to-career-informational-one-pager/>

- 3) On May 1, 2024, the C2C governing board approved adding the Department of Developmental Services as a new data provider to provide key insights into the lives of Californians living with a developmental disability.²

At the time of this analysis, none of the analytical tools (dashboards) are operational by the C2C; however, the C2C website indicates data will be available in 2024.

Data agreements with data providers. As previously mentioned, in May 2022, following an 18-month process, all 15 data providers, originally envisioned by the Governor to provide data elements into the longitudinal data base, signed two data agreements that would enable the sharing of data with the C2C.

Heralded as a monolithic and landmark legal agreement, the Governor’s press release stated, “with these legal agreements in place, it will now be possible to compile information using strict security standards, while still making data available through easy-to-use tools designed for a variety of users. The tools will roll out in phases over the next five years.”³

The legal agreement referenced in the press release is the *Partnership agreement between the data providers and the managing entity for the C2C*, which, contains the responsibilities of the data providers and the managing entity of the C2C. While the partnership agreement has each data providers annually uploading data into secure, segregated data repositories, there is a caveat that each data provider retains sole control over the source data. Each data provider has the legal authority to reject, add, or remove data points contributed to the C2C.

Furthermore, the data agreement states, the data submissions by the data providers are a “request” and not a requirement; meaning at any point a data provider may reject adding or submitting data to the C2C data system. The data partnership agreement does not require the data providers to collect data for submission nor does it specify that the data providers must retain data for submission.

As stated on the C2C’s website, “the Office of C2C does not collect new data from students of families. It links and enables the public to gain insight from data that has already been collected and validated by the [C2C’s] data partners.”¹ The C2C is a managing repository for data, it does not collect, nor own the data, but rather manages or maintains the data provided by the data providers. *The C2C has no authority to mandate nor require data providers to collect and transmit the data to the system.*

Existing structure to add data to the system. EDC Section 10861 permits the C2C governing board to add or remove requested data points based on changes in the usage of the data. EDC Section 10866 further explains how the governing board may expand the P20W data set provided by the data providers. The P20W data set is the agreed upon “original set” of data to be provided by the data providers pursuant to EDC and the partnership agreements.

² <https://c2c.ca.gov/c2c-governing-board-votes-to-approve-adding-department-of-developmental-services-as-new-data-partner/>

³ <https://www.gov.ca.gov/2022/05/12/californias-cradle-to-career-data-system-achieves-early-milestones-announces-multi-agency-data-sharing-agreement/>

Specifically, the C2C governing board may expand the P20W data set to include additional data points by either: 1) approving additional data providers; or 2) by requesting additional data points from data providers.

Scenarios for how the C2C governing board can add data points to the data system is outlined in the C2C governance manual, published on February 28, 2024.

- Scenario 1 – A data provider and the managing entity explore including an additional data point to the data set. The director of data programs assists the data provider with a data definition and a method for data transfer. The data provider, the Governing Board member of the data provider, and the Executive Director of the C2C all agree on the requested change to the data set. At this point the changes are presented to the C2C governing board who will either vote to include the data set as part of the annual data set for all data providers; or, the initial data provider begins to share the data point as part of their annual transfer of data to the C2C.
- Scenario 2 – The Data and Tools Advisory Board for the C2C recommends additional data points and the C2C conducts a feasibility study as to whether the data point is available and can be validated by the C2C. The feasibility study is presented to the Data and Tools Advisory Board who will then determines whether to move forward with presenting the additional data points to the Governing Board for a vote. The data is then requested from the applicable data providers.

Within the current year, the C2C governing board has successfully added a new data provider and new data points from the California State University and the University of California. SB 1391 (Rubio) circumvents the established pathways in code for adding a data point to the C2C, by requiring the C2C to create a dashboard and ask each data provider to collect and transmit the data for the new dashboard.

The measure does not address what occurs if the C2C asks for the data for the dashboard and the data providers refuse.

Analytical tools – dashboards. The C2C is required to create and display dashboards filled with the data from data providers. The Education Code authorizes the governing board of the C2C to create new analytical tools that would help the public interact with data and the Office of the C2C creates and maintains the infrastructure of the analytical tools. The Office of the C2C also provides analysis and recommends to the governing board the type of analytical tools that should be created/added to the C2C.

As previously mentioned the Legislature, has two representatives on the C2C governing board.

The Committee may wish to contemplate whether a bill is the appropriate tool to compel the C2C to create a dashboard or if the existing Legislative members on the C2C governing board should request it during a C2C board meeting.

Once operational, the C2C intends to display eight dashboards, each with their own theme and educational outcome for the user. One of the intended dashboards, is a teacher training and retention dashboard.⁴

The C2C teacher training and retention dashboard will provide information on teacher workforce trends, including training pipelines, teacher employment and retention, and employment trends for former teachers.

An update on the dashboard was provided in July 2023 during a board meeting of the C2C governing board. According to the update, the C2C governing board approved additional data points to be included in the data set provided by data providers that would make the first phase of the teacher dashboard possible.

The teacher dashboard with the new data points will include the following:

- 1) Infographic showing the types of certificate or degrees that the California State University teacher preparation program participants completed at a community college or four-year institution;
- 2) Infographic showing the alignment of demographics between participants enrolled in the California State University teacher preparation programs and individuals earning teaching credentials;
- 3) Infographic showing the alignment of California State University credential program completion in comparison with the areas of Commission for teacher credentialing areas of authorization;
- 4) Infographic showing the ways teachers are trained and credentialed, and the number of people earning teaching credentials; and,
- 5) Infographic showing, for teachers who stop working in the education industry, the industries that hire them, and median change in earnings.

Even though the C2C is planning a teacher training and retention dashboard, SB 1391 (Rubio) is not duplicative, as there are data points required by the measure that are not included in the planned C2C dashboard. Specifically, the data points related to teacher preparation grant programs are not included in the C2C dashboard and some of the data points required by SB 1391 (Rubio) are not currently transmitted to the C2C.

Committee Staff note the measure requires the collection of various data points and states it is the intention of the Legislature for the data to be transmitted to the C2C, but stops short of mandating the transmission of the data.

Arguments in support. The Education Trust – West expresses the need for SB 1391 (Rubio) stating, “in 2023, the California Research Bureau (CRB) compiled a report to evaluate the implementation and effectiveness of six teacher grant programs in the state. However, due to the lack of data, CRB could not provide a comprehensive picture of the impacts of teacher grant programs for the educator workforce. In addition to data needed to evaluate the impact of

⁴ <https://c2c.ca.gov/cradle-to-career-dashboards/>

programs, education data experts have long uplifted the importance of urgently connecting annually updated teacher demographic data to workforce data. The current demographic makeup of California’s teacher workforce is not reflective of the state’s student population. The shortage of a qualified and diverse teacher workforce remains a challenge in many areas throughout California and school, district leaders, and state-level decision makers need actionable data to evaluate ongoing investments and the needs to greater supports. The Office of the C2C is currently planning on releasing the Teacher Training and Retention Dashboard in the Summer of 2024. However, this legislation would ensure that the data points that contributing agencies – such as the Commission on Teacher Credentialing, the California Department of Education, and institutions of higher education – share with C2C for inclusion in the dashboard are comprehensive enough to provide policymakers, researchers, and advocates with a clear and actionable picture of the current state of our teacher workforce and the effectiveness of teacher preparation pathways.

Committee comments. The C2C data system was designed as a collaborative agreement between 15 data providers and Governor Newsom for the transmission and display of integrated data on educational and workforce pathways in California. The data system was designed to never “require” the data providers to relinquish control of their data and by never stipulating an oversight or regulatory body, the following policy questions remain unanswered:

- 1) *Who is responsible for ensuring participation in the C2C data system if data providers refuse to provide new or existing data sets?*
- 2) *Who is responsible for ensuring the analytical tools are providing the appropriate data to help the Legislature make informed decisions?*

SB 1391 (Rubio) requires the C2C to create a teacher training and retention dashboard and requires specific data points to be displayed on the dashboard. By requiring the operational tool, the measure is in turn, requiring the C2C to request the necessary data elements from the data providers.

SB 1391 (Rubio) honors the existing data request procedures by mandating the collection of data by the data providers and then stating it is the intent of the Legislature for the data points to be transmitted to the C2C.

The measure does not require the data points to be transmitted and therefore, the C2C could still conduct its operational procedures for including a new data point to the data sets in compliance with state law and their governance manual. However, this measure does not account for the event of the data providers refusing to provide data points for the potentially statutorily required database.

The Committee may wish to consider whether mandating the creation of a dashboard without a guarantee of the transmission of the required data for the dashboard is the appropriate method of procuring data to answer policy questions.

Moving forward the author may wish to either include a severability clause for any data points required by this measure if the data providers refuse to provide the data point to the C2C; or to include an annual reporting requirement for all data points requested by the C2C that are rejected by data providers.

REGISTERED SUPPORT / OPPOSITION:

Support

Alameda County Office of Education
Association of California School Administrators
California Chamber of Commerce
California Charter Schools Association
California Council on Teacher Education
California Teachers Association
Californians Together
CFT- a Union of Educators & Classified Professionals, AFT, AFL-CIO
Children Now
Create CA
Educators for Excellence - Los Angeles
EdVoice
Latinos for Education
Loyola Marymount University - the Center for Equity for English Learners
Northern California College Promise Coalition
Para Los Ninos
Public Advocates
Southwest California Legislative Council
Teach Plus
Teach Plus - California
The Education Trust - West
TNTP Reimagine Teaching
Tri County Chamber Alliance
Voters of Tomorrow

Opposition

None on file.

Analysis Prepared by: Ellen Cesaretti-Monroy / HIGHER ED. / (916) 319-3960